



# **AIR AND ROAD TRANSPORT IN EAST AFRICA: REGIONAL COORDINATION MEETING REPORT**

**19 April 2001**

**For REDSO/ESA's Strategic Objective # 623-002-01:  
Increased Use of Critical Information  
by USAID and Other Decision-Makers in the Region**

**Rural and Agricultural Incomes with a Sustainable Environment (RAISE)  
IQC No. PCE-I-00-99-00001-00, Task Order 805:  
Regional Trade Analytical Agenda (RTAA)  
Implemented by TechnoServe-Kenya and ARD**

Submitted to:  
USAID/REDSO/ESA  
PO Box 30261  
Nairobi, Kenya

Submitted by:  
ARD-RAISE Consortium  
1601 N. Kent Street, Suite 800  
Arlington, VA 22209 U.S.A.  
[www.ard-raise.com](http://www.ard-raise.com)





## **AIR AND ROAD TRANSPORT IN EAST AFRICA: REGIONAL COORDINATION MEETING REPORT**

**19 April 2001**

by  
**N. S. Mwanja  
J. M. Nzoya  
T. C. Oketch**

of

**TechnoServe Kenya**

**Presented to  
USAID/REDSO/ESA**

under the Rural and Agricultural Incomes with a Sustainable Environment (RAISE)  
Contract No. PCE-I-00-99-00001-00  
Implemented by TechnoServe-Kenya and ARD

### **ARD-RAISE Consortium**

1601 North Kent St., Ste 800  
Arlington, VA 22209  
Tel: 703-807-5700, Fax: 703-807-0889  
gkerr@ardinc.com

*The ARD-RAISE Consortium:  
Associates in Rural Development, Cargill Technical Services,  
Associates for International Resources and Development, CARANA Corporation,  
A.P. Gross & Company, International Programs Consortium, Land O' Lakes,  
Purdue University, and TechnoServe*

---

## FOREWORD

Transportation barriers are a major constraint in east and southern Africa. This scenario has resulted in high transportation costs that inhibit trade and food security in the region. To address transport problems and disseminate solutions to policymakers and stakeholders, USAID/REDSO has sponsored a Regional Trade Analytical Agenda to generate technical information on transportation and trade in the region for informed dialogue among policymakers and other stakeholders. It is through this forum that discussions were held to identify areas requiring further analysis for policy change. In one such forum, held in Nairobi in 1999, two analytical study areas were identified: one in aviation and the other in road transport. The aviation study was to look at how this mode of transport can contribute to increased regional trade and integration in East Africa. The other study was to look at ways of improving enforcement of the existing regulations and laws for efficient road transport in East Africa. Consultants were commissioned to undertake the research and prepare reports for dissemination to various stakeholders, including policymakers. It was, however, a requirement that a peer review/regional coordination meeting be held to discuss the consultant's drafts and ensure that the consultants have addressed all the requirements adequately before finalizing the reports. This report presents the deliberations of the peer review/regional coordination meeting that was held in Nairobi on 19 April 2001.

Aviation is important because regional integration is taking root in East Africa and the sector will increasingly play a lead role in the transportation of certain commodities as well as passengers. This implies that the issues of capacity, safety, efficiency and modernization of the industry merit attention at the moment. The study findings indicate that the economic contribution of the aviation subsector is increasing due to the changing economic and political situation in the region. This notwithstanding, and although air transportation is the fastest growing mode of transport in the world due to its speed and efficiency, the East African region has not taken full advantage and hence can not realize full integration because of limitations in that sector.

On the other hand, road usage in the region is governed by laws and regulations that stipulate requirements to be accomplished before one is allowed to use the road system. Additionally, there are laws that govern the operation of road transport equipment and the quality of service that road transport service consumers should expect. The responsibilities of the persons who operate equipment on roads are also stipulated in these laws and regulations. Even then, the requirements are not enforced in a uniform manner in East Africa, and there is a need to enforce these requirements, particularly for heavy goods vehicles from foreign countries that travel through other national frontiers. The requirements are stipulated under COMESA and the East African Community multilateral agreements, as well as in bilateral agreements. These need to be enforced, and where necessary, analyzed and recommendations made for effective implementation. This will promote cohesive use of the road transport infrastructure and facilities in the region.

There are no common standards for passenger vehicles, yet a lot of human traffic is crossing the borders daily. It is also important for road transport operators to have vehicle standards so they can know which vehicles are allowed into the region and avoid expenses that result from importing nonconforming vehicles. Within this context, the law needs to be reviewed to cover

the information drivers should have as they cross into different countries and regional zones to enhance their security and safety. Such information could be given as a package and where necessary, be available for public use so that consignors, consignees, passengers and transporters may know the difficulties that are encountered en route. The road safety standards on East African roads are considered poor and many concerns have been raised for improvement. The study analyzes the legal framework that governs vehicle operations and quantifies requirements for effective road transport management in East Africa.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>FOREWORD .....</b>	<b>i</b>
<b>ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS.....</b>	<b>iv</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1.INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1    PURPOSE OF THE PEER REVIEW WORKSHOP.....	1
1.2    OPENING REMARKS BY TECHNO SERVE AND USAID/REDSO.....	1
1.3    ORGANIZATION OF THE MEETING .....	2
<b>CHAPTER 2.AIR TRANSPORT AS A MODE OF TRANSPORT FOR REGIONAL TRADE IN EAST AFRICA .....</b>	<b>3</b>
2.1    THE PRESENTATION .....	3
2.2    DEBATE AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....	4
2.2.1 <i>Scope and Coverage of the Analytical Study .....</i>	<i>4</i>
2.2.2 <i>Liberalization of Air Transport.....</i>	<i>4</i>
2.2.3 <i>Airport Charges and Tariffs .....</i>	<i>5</i>
2.2.4 <i>Promotion of Air Safety and Aviation Security .....</i>	<i>6</i>
2.2.5 <i>Scheduled and Nonscheduled Services.....</i>	<i>6</i>
2.2.6 <i>Airport Development Capacity .....</i>	<i>7</i>
2.2.7 <i>Privatization and Airport Services.....</i>	<i>7</i>
2.2.8 <i>Airfreight Traffic Analysis and Traffic Forecast.....</i>	<i>8</i>
2.2.9 <i>Harmonization of Trade Policies.....</i>	<i>8</i>
2.2.10 <i>Integrated Study on Transport in the Region.....</i>	<i>9</i>
<b>CHAPTER 3. THE ENFORCEMENT OF LAWS AND REGULATIONS THAT GOVERN THE ROAD TRANSPORT INDUSTRY IN EAST AFRICA .....</b>	<b>10</b>
3.1    INTRODUCTION .....	10
3.2    THE PROBLEM .....	10
3.3    THE OBJECTIVE .....	10
3.4    FINDINGS OF THE STUDY .....	11
3.5    DISCUSSION OF THE REPORT .....	12
3.5.1 <i>Coverage of the Scope of Work .....</i>	<i>12</i>
3.5.2 <i>Road Infrastructure .....</i>	<i>12</i>
3.5.3 <i>Training of Drivers.....</i>	<i>12</i>
3.5.4 <i>Review of Road Laws.....</i>	<i>13</i>
3.5.5 <i>Axle Load Control .....</i>	<i>13</i>
3.5.6 <i>Political Interference.....</i>	<i>13</i>
3.5.7 <i>Concluding Remarks on the Report.....</i>	<i>14</i>
<b>CHAPTER 4.THE WAY FORWARD .....</b>	<b>15</b>
4.1    TRANSPORT POLICY HARMONIZATION IN EASTERN AND SOUTHERN AFRICA.....	15
4.1.1 <i>Efforts by RTAA Partners .....</i>	<i>15</i>
4.1.2 <i>Study Ownership and Responsibility for Implementation.....</i>	<i>15</i>
4.1.3 <i>Development of Implementation Matrix .....</i>	<i>15</i>
4.1.4 <i>Monitoring the Performance of Existing Concessions .....</i>	<i>16</i>
4.1.5 <i>Harmonization of Transport and Trade Policies .....</i>	<i>16</i>
4.2    CLOSURE OF THE MEETING .....	16
<b>APPENDIX A. LIST OF PARTICIPANTS.....</b>	<b>A-1</b>
<b>APPENDIX B. WORKSHOP PROGRAM .....</b>	<b>B-1</b>

---

## ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ACIS	Advance Cargo Information System
AJAS	African Joint Air Services
AVSEC	Aviation Security
ARD	Associates for Rural Development
CNS/ATM	Communications Navigation Surveillance/Air Traffic Management
COMESA	Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa
EAC	East African Community
EATI	East African Transportation Initiative
ECA	Economic Commission for Africa
ECAPAPA	East and Central Africa Program for Agricultural Policy Analysis
ESA	Eastern and Southern Africa
ESATI	Eastern and Southern Africa Transportation Initiative
GHA	Greater Horn of Africa
IATA	International Air Transport Association
ICAO	International Civil Aviation Organization
IGAD	Intergovernmental Authority on Development
JKIA	Jomo Kenyatta International Airport
KAA	Kenya Airports Authority
REDSO	Regional Economic Development Services Office
RTAA	Regional Trade Analytical Agenda
SADC	Southern Africa Development Community
SATCC	Southern Africa Transport and Communications Commission
TTCA	Transit Transport Coordination Authority
UCIFA	Uganda Clearing and Forwarding Association
USAID	United States Agency for International Development

---

## CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Purpose of the Peer Review Workshop

This report covers the deliberations of a peer review/coordination meeting that was organized by TechnoServe to review and coordinate the production of two research reports concerning the transport sector. The meeting took place on 19 April 2001, at the Nairobi Safari Club. Two consultants had been previously engaged to prepare analytical reports on the air and road transportation subsectors in East Africa. The research titles are:

- a) Air Transport as a Mode of Transport for Regional Trade in East Africa
- b) Analysis of the Enforcement of the Existing Laws and Regulations that Govern Road Transport Industry in East Africa.

### 1.2 Opening Remarks by TechnoServe and USAID/REDSO

The Deputy Director of TechnoServe Kenya, Mr. Joseph Mwangangi, delivered the opening address. In his introductory remarks, he gave a background of the Regional Trade Analytical Agenda program (RTAA) under which the two studies were undertaken. He indicated that RTAA has three components that include:

- cross-border trade,
- cost of transport analysis, and
- comparative analysis.

Mr. Mwangangi noted that the ARD-RAISE Consortium implemented the three components with funding from USAID/REDSO. At this juncture, Mr. Mwangangi invited Ms. Mariay Kitiabi, a regional trade expert and manager of RTAA activities at the United States Agency for International Development/Regional Economic Development Services Office (USAID/REDSO) to address the participants. Ms. Kitiabi observed that REDSO would want to see results from RTAA activities through translation of policy to action through dialogue with policymakers and stakeholders. She noted that REDSO's mission is to support US missions in information generation and dissemination to potential beneficiaries. This, she reiterated, was the reason REDSO was working closely with regional bodies like the East African Community (EAC), Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD), Transit Transport Coordination Authority (TTCA), Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa (COMESA), Southern Africa Development Community/Southern Africa Transport and Communications Commission (SADC/SATCC) and Economic Commission for Africa (ECA), among others. She further noted that the ARD-RAISE Consortium is a facilitator of collaboration among the RTAA partners and that is why the studies are organized under its ambit. In concluding, Ms. Kitiabi indicated that this peer review/regional coordination meeting is part of the process of ensuring that quality information is generated and disseminated to the relevant institutions for their use.

---

### 1.3 Organization of the Meeting

To consider the contents of each of the studies adequately, the morning and afternoon sessions were dedicated to discussing the aviation and road transport study reports respectively. The deliberations of the morning session were moderated by Mr. Godfrey Onyango-Matata, the Secretary General of TTCA, while the afternoon session was moderated by Mr. Jackson N. Kinyanjui, the COMESA Advance Cargo Information System (ACIS) National Coordinator in Kenya.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> The list of participants is in Appendix A while a copy of the Agenda is in Appendix B.



---

## CHAPTER 2. AIR TRANSPORT AS A MODE OF TRANSPORT FOR REGIONAL TRADE IN EAST AFRICA

The TechnoServe Regional Transport Policy Advisor, Mr. Nzuki Mwanja, presented the requirements of this study to the participants. He indicated that the study is important because regional integration is taking root in East Africa and aviation will increasingly play a lead role in the transportation of certain commodities, as well as passengers. Hence the issues of capacity, safety, efficiency and modernization of the industry merit attention at the moment. He further noted that the study has a defined problem and objectives. Thereafter, Mr. Mwanja invited the consultant, Dr. Evaristus Irandu of the University of Nairobi to make his presentation, based on the scope of work, his findings and conclusions to enable the chairman to open debate on the report.

### 2.1 The Presentation

Dr. Irandu introduced his presentation by highlighting the objectives of the study and what he was expected to do. He explained that he was expected to

- document the development of air transport services in the subregion as well as challenges facing the sector, including long-term perspectives and planned action programs;
- analyze what the aviation authorities are doing to promote air safety and aviation security (AVSEC);
- define the AVSEC mechanism and analyze what is required to encourage member states to utilize this mechanism;
- analyze the development in institutional reform to facilitate market-oriented operations and service delivery, considering the interests of air service users in the subregion;
- document available air transport data and time series over the last five years for each country; and
- determine the ruling charges in airports and how they affect airport usage in the region.

Dr Irandu reiterated that economic contribution of the aviation subsector in East Africa is increasing due to the changing economic and political situation in the region. He noted, however, that although air transport is the fastest growing mode of transportation in the world due to its speed and efficiency, the East African region has not taken full advantage of this sector and hence can not realize full integration. Dr Irandu indicated that this scenario is brought about by the various factors (based on the study findings):

- air transport tariffs are high in the region;
- high flight safety/security risks;
- open skies/liberalization policies are quite politicized and have lots of limitations;
- under utilization of available capacities in airports because the region does not produce enough traded commodities for air transport;
- weaknesses in existing bilateral and multilateral regional agreements, i.e., granting air traffic rights on reciprocal basis;

- inadequate airport facilities, whose performance is inhibited by stringent custom requirements and unjustified charges;
- lengthy procedural/documentation delays at the airports;
- existing equipment and infrastructure is old and outdated; and
- the Communication Navigation Surveillance to Air Traffic Management (CNS/ATM) system has not been fully appreciated and the member states are taking too long to begin implementation. This has led to reliance on ground-based navigation systems, whose reliability is questionable due to advances in technology.

In concluding, the consultant indicated that he had made recommendations on how to counter these shortcomings in the future. Thereafter, he called on the chairman to open debate on the report.

## **2.2 Debate and Recommendations**

### **2.2.1 Scope and Coverage of the Analytical Study**

The participants were concerned that such an important study was implemented for only three countries in East Africa. They observed that the study should cover a broader area like the whole of the Greater Horn of Africa (GHA) countries, or even the COMESA region. They noted that the aviation market for the region should actually cover all of eastern and southern Africa (ESA) if airline companies are to realize economies of scale. In response, the TechnoServe Regional Transport Policy Advisor explained that this limited study was done to keep within the available financial resources, and to observe the time limits within which the project should be concluded.

#### ***Recommendations***

*The participants suggested that USAID/REDSO be requested to finance a broader study to at least cover the GHA in the near future. They observed that this would enhance the benefits of this study to a broader spectrum of operators and policymakers in the region. If possible, the study should cover the ESA region where RTAA is being executed. They stressed that in the next study, the scope and coverage needs to be widened to cover more countries in COMESA and SADC. They urged the consultant to advise on the coverage and the scope for the next study in his current report.*

### **2.2.2 Liberalization of Air Transport**

The East Africa countries are signatories to the Yamoussoukro decision that advocates open skies policies and gradual liberalization of scheduled and nonscheduled intra-Africa air services. This declaration has immense benefits and the countries of East Africa should implement its requirements without undue delay. The participants noted that Kenya Airways has been privatized with a measure of success while plans are at advanced stages to privatize Air Tanzania and Uganda Airlines. They cautioned, however, that privatization has inherent negative impacts in the short term. These include loss in jobs, leading to loss of income, and psychological effects, especially on heads of family.

The participants noted that despite the short-term challenges in liberalization, reasonable progress is being made and airlines in this region are now allowed multiple designations to manage the competition and enhance industrial growth. They noted with concern, however, the poor performance of new airlines like African Joint Air Services (AJAS), a limited airline alliance formed by Tanzania, Uganda and South Africa.

### **Recommendations**

*Although privatization has not resulted in optimal benefits, it is too early to judge its success or failure. There is need for political commitment and industrial regulation, lacking in the current phase of air transport liberalization. The East African countries need a well-documented privatization policy that would help to rationalize airport and industrial operations for the region.*

*The consultant was asked to advise on how a regional regulatory body can be formed to manage the industry under a liberalized situation. He should also propose the modality of monitoring the privatization process in order to ensure top-level policy decisions are expeditiously implemented.*

#### **2.2.3 Airport Charges and Tariffs**

The main airport charges relate to air navigation, landing and parking charges which are all paid by the airlines, while passengers pay airport service charges either directly or through their air ticket fare. In East Africa, these charges are high, making airports noncompetitive.

It was alluded, however, that most of the charges are cost-based and before any revision is made, consultations should be undertaken with airport users. Normally the new charges would be first discussed with airline representatives under the International Air Transport Association (IATA). However, the practice in East Africa is that there are many departments imposing charges at the airports, making them noncompetitive and forcing some airlines to shift to other country destinations.

Passengers pay service charges directly or indirectly through the tickets. The current scenario at all seven international airports (Jomo Kenyatta, Moi, Eldoret, Kilimanjaro, Dar es Salaam, Zanzibar and Entebbe) is that passengers pay US\$40 per entry, a charge that makes the international airports expensive for stopover passengers.

### **Recommendation**

*The civil aviation and airport authorities should adhere to the International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO) guidelines on airport charges it was argued, and the existing ground tariff rates and other charges should be reviewed and harmonized with the active involvement of the major stakeholders. These charges should be rationalized and harmonized to avoid unnecessary exploitation by airport authorities. At this time of liberalization, there should be a firm regulatory body to manage predatory pricing that may result, due to competition. The*

---

*consultant was urged to review and identify unjustified charges and propose how they should be rationalized or eliminated all together.*

#### **2.2.4 Promotion of Air Safety and Aviation Security**

The civil authorities in the region are promoting air security by taking positive measures to implement the CNS/ATM system, despite government delays in securing the required funds. This is a costly investment, whose benefits can only be realized fully if it is done at once for the region to avoid cross-border air management limitations if some countries lag behind in implementation. It was also noted that EAC is implementing an air safety project along the same lines as the CNS/ATM, a move that should be supported by all in the industry.

It was also argued that air traffic accidents take too long to investigate, due to lack of adequate personnel and the required equipment. The delays were seen as a way of sacrificing safety in the region and in this regard, air safety is not maintained throughout the region on a sustainable basis. It was, however, indicated that investigations take so long because of the sensitivity of supreme nation's airspace, where assistance from outside is only sought during serious emergencies.

#### ***Recommendations***

*It was recommended that discussions on joint use of airspace should be enhanced under the EAC and some of the lines dedicated for the military released for commercial traffic. Ground-based radar systems should be replaced with new satellite systems due to the latter's reliability. The participants concurred that this may be costly in the short run but is viable in the long run.*

*It was also proposed that the governments and private sector should explore alternative training opportunities through government/private sector partnerships. The training should emphasize safety and the EAC should be lobbied to draw up a regional navigation plan for harmonized development and management of the airspace. The consultant should advise on the air space can be optimally utilized and propose a program for the proposed government/private sector partnership in training.*

#### **2.2.5 Scheduled and Nonscheduled Services**

The operation of scheduled services to any destination depends on the granted traffic rights by the country of destination. These rights are stipulated and governed by Article 6 of the Chicago Convention of 1944. Currently, there are 33 foreign international scheduled airlines serving Nairobi, 18 serving Dar es Salaam and nine serving Entebbe. In addition, there are nonscheduled services including air charters, which connect small airports and airstrips in the region. Charter flights provide a variety of services, including crop spraying, aerial photography, missionary charitable work, and prospecting and tour charters for tourism promotion, among others. At the same time, within the EAC countries, fifth traffic rights of sending onward traffic to destinations beyond their countries are yet to be granted between

each other. This, it was observed, is an important move that should be considered in this study and a recommendation made.

### **Recommendation**

*There is need to synchronize airline timetables in the region, considering that scheduling in other destinations outside Africa influences regional schedules. This will facilitate and enhance capacity utilization in airports and among airlines. This synchronization of schedules should go hand-in-hand with improved agent coordination operating for various airlines.*

*The consultant should consider the existing schedules and propose ways of synchronizing the same and propose a framework for management/coordination of airline agent's activities to avoid conflicts.*

## **2.2.6 Airport Development Capacity**

The subregion has seven international airports, capable of handling the latest aircraft. The management of airports is the domain of the respective airport authorities in the three countries, i.e., Kenya Airports Authority (KAA), Tanzania Civil Aviation Authority and Uganda Civil Aviation Authority. The study established that there has been growth in passenger and cargo traffic in Kenya and Tanzania. However, despite the increasing traffic, there are inhibiting regional constraints. These include a limited air traffic market in the region, inadequate airport infrastructure, lack of adequately qualified technical personnel (pilots, engineers and technicians), inexperienced airline management, political interference and inadequate private/public sector support for improvement projects. Additionally, the observed neglect of airstrips is of great concern as these feed into the major airports due to their importance for tourism and emergency situations, such as famine and epidemics.

### **Recommendation**

*The governments should work in partnership with the private sector to fund major capital works in airports. Further, it is pertinent to evaluate the National Civil Aviation policies and look at the incentive possibilities to encourage private sector participation in aviation service delivery. There should be concerted efforts to develop these airstrips into national airports that can generate their own traffic. The consultant was directed to advise on how the public/private sector partnerships can be constituted for the development of the sector.*

## **2.2.7 Privatization and Airport Services**

Kenya and Uganda, as partner states, have taken significant steps to privatize auxiliary airport services. For instance

- KAA has privatized certain services at Jomo Kenyatta International Airport (JKIA), such as catering, environmental management, taxi shuttle transport and car park management.

- Uganda civil aviation authority has privatized some airport services, including ground handling and duty free shops.

### **Recommendation**

*There is a need to continuously monitor the progress of privatization. The countries in the region should pursue harmonized privatization policies through the establishment of a regulatory body (civil aviation board) that will work out pricing policies in respect to privatized services.*

*The consultant should advise on the issue of ground handling costs and how these can be reduced significantly for improvement of regional competitiveness.*

### **2.2.8 Airfreight Traffic Analysis and Traffic Forecast**

At the domestic airports, especially Kisumu and Mwanza, domestic cargo accounts for over 70 percent of all cargo handled. Over the last two decades, East African countries have witnessed significant development. This has been reflected in the growth of the horticultural industry, where products are primarily sold in European markets. This growth is due to a vibrant private sector involvement and should be nurtured. To ensure continued growth in this sector, there is a need for authorities to enhance coordination of the transport modes.

### **Recommendation**

*Due to linear growth in cargo, there should be sustained provision of adequate capacity for the transport of horticultural products to feasible markets. At the same time, the documentation procedures should be minimized and cargo-handling processes at airports rationalized to curb unnecessary delays. The current problems in bad feeder roads and the many roadblocks leading to airports are unnecessary, as they contribute to delays. The consultant was urged to advise on how best to rationalize the existing documentation. He should also present a strong argument for the development of feeder roads to airports and airstrips.*

### **2.2.9 Harmonization of Trade Policies**

Trade in the region is hampered by differentiated trade and transportation policies in the region. For example, Uganda is allowing foreign carriers to enjoy the fifth traffic rights while Kenya and Tanzania are opposed to this move. This impacts negatively on trade and investment in the region.

### **Recommendation**

*The countries in the region should work toward a harmonized trade regime to promote trade and investment for enhanced economic growth.*

---

### 2.2.10 Integrated Study on Transport in the Region

The participants observed that although the current study is a subset of an earlier study on Transportation Cost Analysis in East Africa, undertaken in 1995, the situation has changed so much that the earlier study should be updated to cover all modes. Such an approach, it was argued, would bring out coordination and show how the sector is performing to date, given that many policies have since been changed due to liberalization of the economies.

#### ***Recommendation***

*The stakeholders requested that REDSO consider financing an update of the earlier study and advised the consultant to propose areas of coverage for this revision. The consultant should also explore details of wider terms of reference for the broader study and advise on the modality of undertaking it. Since air, road, rail and other surface modes compliment each other, the consultant should suggest an integrated study covering aviation and surface transportation modes. He should also propose modalities of implementing the recommendations contained in his report on aviation in the region.*



---

## **CHAPTER 3. THE ENFORCEMENT OF LAWS AND REGULATIONS THAT GOVERN THE ROAD TRANSPORT INDUSTRY IN EAST AFRICA**

The presenter in this session was the consultant Mr. Cyril Batatia of the National Transport Corporation in Tanzania, while the moderator was Mr. Jackson Kinyanjui of COMESA.

### **3.1 Introduction**

Road usage in the region is governed by legislation stipulating requirements to be accomplished before one is allowed to use the road system. There are laws that govern the operations of road transport equipment and the quality of service that road transport service consumers should expect. The people who operate road equipment (namely drivers) and vehicles that ply the roads must be regulated. The regulation requirement implies the existence of clear standards to be followed. Legal rules are supposed to govern vehicle capacity utilization, size, and conduct while on the road. Vehicles that transport heavy goods (especially from foreign countries) through other national borders should be regulated. Regional transit requirements are stipulated under COMESA and the EAC, as well as bilateral agreements. All these need to be analyzed and recommendations of effective implementation made to the policymakers and stakeholders. This will promote a cohesive use of the road transport infrastructure and facilities in the region.

### **3.2 The Problem**

For heavy goods vehicles, member countries have agreed to observe COMESA standards. The standards are not, however, enforced in a uniform manner and there is no common standard for passenger vehicles, yet a lot of human traffic is crossing the borders daily. It is also important for road transport operators to have standards of vehicles that are allowed into the region, to avoid expenses that result from importing nonconforming vehicles.

Within this context, the law should cover the kind of information drivers would have as they cross country and regional zones, as well as enhance their security and safety. This information could be given as a package and be availed, where necessary, for public use so that consignors, consignees, passengers and transporters are warned of the difficulties that may be encountered en route. The safety standards of East African roads are poor and a lot of concerns have been raised for improvement. This study is intended to analyze the legal framework governing vehicle operation and to quantify the requirements for effective road transport management in East Africa.

### **3.3 The Objective**

The study's objective is to investigate the level of enforcement of legal requirements in road transport in East Africa. It is in this perspective that the study evaluates the laws and regulations governing road transport and relates these to the enforcement machinery. This exercise includes:

- reviewing the legislative laws relating to road transport in the three countries;



- critically evaluating the need for legislative standardization and harmonized enforcement to alleviate corruption on regional roads and documenting efforts undertaken by the East African countries towards this end;
- reviewing the process of road transport legislative enforcement in each member country;
- identifying areas of conflict that need to be harmonized;
- proposing a method of uniform enforcement of transport laws and the harmonization process where there is conflict;
- assessing the implementation by member countries of existing agreements on road transport; and
- proposing a road transport policy review program that can enhance harmonization of the road transport policy in East Africa.

### 3.4 Findings of the Study

The major finding of the study is that road transport law enforcement is still weak due to the following reasons:

- There are too many non-roadworthy transport vehicles, so that any crackdown always leads to a public outcry.
- The authorities charged with regulatory and licensing duties are not consistent and operators capitalize on these weaknesses and break the law.
- The traffic departments and local councils do not have adequate traffic management and signaling systems and skills. This leaves room for traffic law abuse by operators.
- Many drivers are not aware of law requirements, especially due to amendments to the Acts, which have not been publicized. Hence, there is vehicle operator noncompliance to the laws and regulation covering road transport.
- In all three countries, there is a lack of coordinated road user training, coupled with poor safety publicity forums that could create road transport safety awareness. The existence of poorly trained personnel and the lack of adequate traffic law enforcement equipment make safety enforcement difficult for traffic personnel.
- Would-be beneficiaries do not know some standards, e.g., driving hour limits that would give long distance drivers adequate time for relaxation.
- Police are poorly equipped to mount strict control posts that can cope with problems such as driving under the influence of alcohol or drugs. They also do not have adequate financing for independent research and investigations to enhance road safety.
- Road design standards and bridges constructed in the 1960s and 1970s are not consistent with modern technology. This has led to variations in weighbridge requirements due to poor calibrations of machines and equipment.
- Corrupt practices along the transit routes due to poor salaries paid to traffic personnel resulting in poor morale.

---

## 3.5 Discussion of the Report

### 3.5.1 Coverage of the Scope of Work

The participants were concerned that despite the many laws in place, enforcement has remained weak and the consultant does not make specific recommendations on how this can be improved. They further indicated that the consultant had not gathered information from Kenya and Uganda since in many sections of the report were written from the Tanzania perspective.

#### ***Recommendation***

*Consultant should make clear recommendations on his findings. He should also cover the other countries adequately in his final report. The report has not considered the environmental issues. In some sections, the consultant copied other reports without synthesizing the material to be consistent with the objectives of this study.*

### 3.5.2 Road Infrastructure

Road maintenance has not been effective and road authorities have not been up-to-date with road signs in all sections of the road network. As a result, the road design and standards are not consistent with the requirements of that law.

#### ***Recommendation***

*There should be a monitoring mechanism to ensure that existing roads are maintained to the required standards. When new roads are constructed, consideration should be given to changing socioeconomic and technological factors. In narrow roads, appropriate road signs and regulations should be put in place. The roads should be compliant to laws and safety maintenance standards. In addition, public footpaths and bicycle paths should be provided because this is an important mode of transport in a region where the majority of the people are poor. In this regard the consultant should incorporate the need for bicycle paths in his study.*

### 3.5.3 Training of Drivers

The region does not have a common training curriculum for drivers, and there are variations in the training standards in the three countries. In spite of this fact, licenses obtained from either of the countries are acceptable to the other two.

#### ***Recommendation***

*The region should develop a harmonized driver training curriculum consistent with new technology and designs of the existing vehicles. The consultant should give guidance on how the training syllabi can be developed and how the process will be managed. He should tie his recommendations to the activities of the EAC.*

### 3.5.4 Review of Road Laws

There are glaring conflicts in the existing transport laws among the three countries, but the consultant has not captured such differences in his write-up. For example, the taxis' legal capacities differ in each country and the consultant doesn't allude to the differences. There are also variations in the implementation of axle load limits and this should be captured and discussed in detail in the report.

#### ***Recommendation***

*The consultant should review the existing national traffic acts in the East Africa countries and propose ways of harmonizing them.*

### 3.5.5 Axle Load Control

The enforcement of the axle load control mechanisms in the region has not been smooth because of the lack of consistency in some countries. The existing axle load control machinery is not sustainable, hence ineffective. There is no regional machinery to manage and monitor implementation across the borders. At the same time, corruption, inaccuracy of weighbridges, congestion and other examples of malpractice incapacitate the implementation process.

#### ***Recommendation***

*An axle load interagency coordinating committee, whose members include COMESA, SADC/SATCC, EAC, IGAD, TTCA and ECA was formed during the Nairobi Axle Load Limits meeting in February 2001. This committee should be empowered and frequent coordinating meetings held. The participants urged TechnoServe to organize another meeting of the committee so that it can deliberate on the implementation process and devise monitoring mechanisms<sup>2</sup>.*

### 3.5.6 Political Interference

Political patronage is a major impediment in the enforcement of the existing regulations. This affects the management of the weighbridges, motor inspection, police force and the ministries coordinating the monitoring and enforcement of various road transport requirements.

#### ***Recommendation***

*The consultant should advise on effective modalities of enhancing the political goodwill in regulatory enforcement for the sector.*

---

<sup>2</sup> The chairmanship rotates among the agencies with TechnoServe as its secretariat.

### **3.5.7 Concluding Remarks on the Report**

In concluding, the participants reiterated that the report is deficient in the following areas:

- The report concentrated mainly on findings in Tanzania and barely touches on Kenya and Uganda.
- In many instances, the consultant is making claims without backing them up with relevant data and quotations from relevant authorities.
- The consultant has not performed an adequate literature search to develop his report and should get more information from the respective institutions. Issues of cargo security and vehicle requirements are not adequately covered. The consultant should advise on how to best enhance the issue of security in the three countries.

---

## CHAPTER 4. THE WAY FORWARD

### 4.1 Transport Policy Harmonization in Eastern and Southern Africa

#### 4.1.1 Efforts by RTAA Partners

The Regional Transport Policy Advisor from TechnoServe gave an overview of the activities from the RTAA's Cost of Transport Component before the participants debated future activities. The debate yielded the recommendations herein. In the past, RTAA has conducted analytical studies and organized seminars and workshops to discuss various policies and strategies related to the subsectors in the transport and trade sectors. The findings of the studies have been exhaustively discussed. However, implementation has proved to be slow and ineffective due to weak stakeholder initiative. To alleviate this situation, the thrust now will be to focus on implementation of these recommendations, which is why high-level coordinating committees should be put in place above the national working groups used under the Eastern and Southern Africa Transportation Initiative (ESATI). There should be well-organized mechanisms and liaison processes with implementing agencies to ensure effective implementation of the various recommendations.

The objective of RTAA has been reduction of transport costs in the region. However, while this focus remains, it will be closely tied with food security in the region in the future. This is because transportation plays a key role in the distribution of food and seed for the benefit of the people. Hence, the primary focus now is to prioritize recommendations emanating from various discussions, especially those that have significant impacts on food security and can be quickly followed up on implementation. The way forward, therefore, is to develop a systematic approach for a follow-up on implementation through strengthening institutions/bodies involved in the implementation process.

#### 4.1.2 Study Ownership and Responsibility for Implementation

The ownership of the studies is not clearly elucidated. This casts further uncertainty on the responsibility of implementation of the recommendations. The studies should be channeled to implementing organizations and institutions through an agreed process. It was recommended that the **interagency coordinating committee** on axle load limits mandate be expanded to cover all aspects of transportation and hence be the channel through which the study materials are directed for implementation and follow-up. TechnoServe was requested to follow up this suggestion and work out methods of implementation.

#### 4.1.3 Development of Implementation Matrix

It was recommended that all findings from the various transport studies and their recommendations be summarized and prioritized for dissemination. Once this is done, a request should be put to REDSO to consider financing an ESA high-level workshop of chief executive officers (CEOs) to agree on hastening the implementation process.

---

#### 4.1.4 Monitoring the Performance of Existing Concessions

In the EAC region, concessions on railways and ports are in progress. However, there are no documented concession/privatization policies in place to facilitate monitoring of the process. It was indicated that the World Bank has developed a **rail and port kit** to monitor and evaluate the progress of commercialization/privatization. It was then advised that the countries covered by RTAA should adopt this kit and start monitoring the process. The interagency coordinating committee should take the lead in the monitoring process.

#### 4.1.5 Harmonization of Transport and Trade Policies

It was reported that USAID is undertaking a study to strengthen and harmonize trade facilitation and food security policies in the region. This study will review past activities adopted by USAID/REDSO in implementation strategies and propose activities for the next five years. Under this study, USAID/REDSO will develop a proposal to have a website for the northern corridor and other corridors in the ESA region. The website will include

- a directory of all the transporters in the region and by corridor;
- ruling rates and tariffs by mode and commodity; and
- general traffic statistics — tons, cost/ton kilometer by road and rail, transshipment costs, port handling charges etc.

#### 4.2 Closure of the Meeting

There being no other business, the chairman thanked the participants for their productive contributions and thereby declared the meeting closed at 5.45 p.m.

## **APPENDICES**

## APPENDIX A. LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

NAME	ORGANIZATION/ADDRESS	TELEPHONE	FACSIMILE
Godfrey M. Onyango	TTCA Northern corridor P.O Box 95341 Mombasa, Kenya	254-11-311572	254-11-311572
Joseph N. Mwangangi	Technoserve Inc P.O Box 14821 Nairobi, Kenya	254-02-443257	254-02-440682
Gerald W. Mbuthia	IGAD P.O Box 2653 Djibouti	253-354050	253-356994
Martin M. Tsuma	Ministry of Information Transport & Communication P.O Box 9144 Dar es Salaam, Tanzania	007-22-715779	007-22723076
Jackson N. Kinyanjui	COMESA P.O Box 54550 Nairobi, Kenya	254-02-211450	254-02-211450
Kirenga R. Ndemino	Ministry of Communication & Transport P.O Box 9144 Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania	007-22-2114427	
Isaak J. Minde	ECAPAPA P.O Box 765 Entebbe, Uganda	006-41321780	006-41-321777
Cyril J. Batalia	National Transport Corporation P.O Box 3101 Dar es Salaam, Tanzania	007-22-2132635 007-22-2112882	
Jovin A. Lyimo	National Transport Corporation P.O Box 3101 Dar es Salaam, Tanzania	007-22-2132635 007-22-2112882	
Gideon Karyoko	EATI/UCIFA	006-41-236688 006-077506748	006-41-236333
Dr Evaristus M. Irandu	University of Nairobi P.O Box 30197 Nairobi	254-02-214913	
Reginah Kitiabi	USAID/REDSO/ESA P.O Box 30261 Nairobi	254-02-864400	254-02-860969
Fredrick m. Karema	University of Nairobi P.O Box 30197 Nairobi	254-02-214913	
Charles N. Kimemia	Ministry of Information Transport & Communication P.O Box 52692 Nairobi	254-02-729200	254-02-723076
Kenneth O. Atieno	Ecotech Consultants P.O Box 68159 Nairobi	254-02-789582	
John C. Okalany	Civil Aviation Authority P. O Box 5536 Kampala, Uganda	006-41-321401	006-41-321401



---

E. N. Sabwa	KFWA – NRB P.O Box 57969 Nairobi	254-02-717401	254-02-722536
Eng. Shadrack	Directorate of Civil Aviation P.O Box 30163 Nairobi, Kenya	254-02-824557	254-02-824716
Jackson M. Nzoya	Kenya Railways P.O Box 30121 Nairobi, Kenya	254-02-221211	254-02-340090
N. S. Mwanja	Technoserve Inc P.O Box 14821 Nairobi , Kenya	254-02-445556 254-02-449699	254-02-440682
Vaughan H. Corbett	Consultant (United Kingdom)	250-754-2704	

---

## APPENDIX B. WORKSHOP PROGRAM

### AGENDA

08.30 – 09.00	Registration
09.00 – 09.30	Opening Statement <i>Technoserve</i> <i>Statement by USAID/REDSO</i>
09.30- 09.45	RTAA activities in the Transport Sector
09.45-10.30	Presentation of the Aviation Report by Dr. E.M. Irandu, <i>University of Nairobi</i>
10.30 – 10.45	<b><i>Tea Break</i></b>
10.45 – 12.45	Q/A- Discussion and Recommendations
12.45 – 14.00	<b><i>Lunch Break</i></b>
14.00 – 15.00	Presentation of the Road Regulations Study Report by Mr. Batalia
15.00 – 16.00	Q/A- Discussion and Recommendations
16.00 – 16.15	<b><i>Tea Break</i></b>
16.15 – 16.45	Q/A- Discussion and Recommendations
16.45 – 17.15	The way Forward for Transport Policy Harmonization in the GHA
17.15 – 17.30	<b><i>A.O.B.</i></b>
17.30 – 17.40	Closure of Meeting